

**THE UNITED CHURCH OF CANADA
SHINING WATERS REGIONAL COUNCIL**

**Minutes of a meeting of the
Pastoral Relations Commission
Tuesday, August 31, 2021**

The Pastoral Relations Commission of Shining Waters Regional Council met on Tuesday, August 31, 2021 by video conference. The meeting began at 9:00 a.m.

Members Present

Paul Stott (chair); Todd McDonald (staff); Donna Bowman-Woodall (ordered); Barbara Hendren (lay); Liz Mackenzie (ordered); Beth Moore (lay); Robin Pilkey (lay)

Regrets: Andrew Comar, Dale Hildebrand, Lawrence Nyarko, William Haughton

Welcome, constituting the meeting and prayer

Paul Stott welcomed everyone, lit the Christ candle, acknowledged the indigenous territory we find ourselves on, led the opening prayer, and called the meeting to order.

Agenda

MOTION by Beth Moore / Barbara Hendren
that the agenda consisting of items that had been circulated to the commission in advance of this meeting be approved.

MOTION

CARRIED

Minutes

MOTION by Donna Bowman-Woodall / Beth Moore
that the minutes of the June 15, 2021 meeting of the commission be approved.

MOTION

CARRIED

Omnibus Motion

MOTION by Robin Pilkey / Barbara Hendren
that the Pastoral Relations Commission take the following actions:

a) **Calls**

... concurs with the request of **Victoria Square Pastoral Charge (Markham)** and approves the call to **Basil Coward**, ordained minister, beginning August 22, 2021, part time based on 20 hours per week with the following terms for Category F and Cost of Living Group Assignment 5: Salary \$72,354 (pro-rated \$36,177) per annum, basic telephone \$800 per annum, Continuing Education and Learning Amount \$1474 (pro-rated \$737) per annum and all other terms according to The Manual I.2., and that in accordance with The Manual I.1.9 this call does not require an act of covenant.

... concurs with the request of **Caledon East Pastoral Charge (Caledon)** and approves the call to **Heather Stevenson**, ordained minister, beginning September 1, 2021, part time based on 10 hours per week with the following terms for Category A and Cost of Living Group Assignment 5: Salary \$63,739 (pro-rated \$15,934.75) salary in addition to the minimum at 5% which equals \$3186.95 (pro-rated \$796.74) for a total salary of \$66,925.95 (pro-rated \$16,731.49) per annum, basic telephone \$600 per annum, Continuing Education and Learning Amount \$1474 (pro-rated \$368.50) per annum and all other terms according to The Manual I.2., and that in accordance with The Manual I.1.9 this call does require an act of covenant.

... concurs with the request of **Caledon Village Pastoral Charge (Caledon)** and approves the call to **Heather Stevenson**, ordained minister, beginning September 1, 2021, part time based on 10 hours per week with the following terms for Category A and Cost of Living Group Assignment 5: Salary \$63,739 (pro-rated \$15,934.75) salary in addition to the minimum at 5% which equals \$3186.95 (pro-rated \$796.74) for a total salary of \$66,925.95 (pro-rated \$16,731.49) per annum, basic telephone \$600 per annum, Continuing Education and Learning Amount \$1474 (pro-rated \$368.50) per annum and all other terms according to The Manual I.2., and that in accordance with The Manual I.1.9 this call does require an act of covenant.

b) **Appointments**

... concurs with the request in change of terms of **Queensville Holland Landing Pastoral Charge (Queensville)** and reappoints **Deborah Celsie**, candidate, beginning July 18, 2021 to July 17, 2023, part time based on 20 hours per week with the following terms for Candidate Category Step 2, 3 plus years and Cost of Living Group Assignment 5: Salary \$62,048 (pro-rated \$31,024) per annum, basic telephone \$900 per annum, Continuing Education and Learning Amount \$1474 (pro-rated \$737) per annum and all other terms according to The Manual I.2., and that in accordance with The Manual I.1.9 this reappointment does not require an act of covenant.

... concurs with the request of **Markham: St. Andrew's Pastoral Charge (Markham)** and appoints **Timothy Dayfoot**, retired ordained minister, beginning September 15, 2021 to March 15, 2022, part time based on 20 hours per week with the following terms for Category F and Cost of Living Group Assignment 5: Salary \$72,354 (pro-rated \$36177), salary in addition to the minimum at 10% which equals \$7235.40 (pro-rated \$3617.70) for a total salary of \$79,589.40 (pro-rated \$39794.70) per annum per annum, basic telephone \$800 per annum, Continuing Education and Learning Amount \$1474 (pro-rated \$737) per annum and all other terms according to The Manual I.2., and that in accordance with The Manual I.1.9 this appointment does not require an act of covenant.

... concurs with the request of **Lake of Bays Pastoral Charge (Dwight)** and appoints **Nina Fulford**, retired ordained minister, beginning September 1, 2021 to August 31, 2022, part time based on 25 hours per week with the following terms for Category F and Cost of Living Group Assignment 3: Salary \$63,613 (pro-rated \$39758.13) per annum, basic telephone \$800 per annum, Continuing Education and Learning Amount \$1474 (pro-rated \$921.25) per annum and all other terms according to The Manual I.2., and that in accordance with The Manual I.1.9 this appointment does require an act of covenant.

... concurs with the request of **Trillium Pastoral Charge (Caledon)** and appoints **Richard (William) Gardner**, candidate, beginning September 1, 2021 to December 1, 2021, part time based on 20 hours per week with the following terms for Candidate Category Step 1 and Cost of Living Group Assignment 5: Salary \$61,687 (pro-rated \$30,843.50) per annum, basic telephone \$800 per annum, Continuing Education and Learning Amount \$1474 (pro-rated \$737) per annum and all other terms according to The Manual I.2., and that in accordance with The Manual I.1.9 this appointment does not require an act of covenant.

... concurs with the request of **Palgrave Pastoral Charge (Palgrave)** and re-appoints **Dyanne Marlock**, candidate, beginning July 1, 2021 to December 31, 2021, part time based on 20 hours per week with the following terms for Candidate Category Step 1 and Cost of Living Group Assignment 5: Salary \$61,687 (pro-rated \$30,843.50) per annum, basic telephone \$800 per annum, Continuing Education and Learning Amount \$1474 (pro-rated \$737) per annum and all other terms according to The Manual I.2., and that in accordance with The Manual I.1.9 this re-appointment does not require an act of covenant.

... concurs with the request of **Richmond Hill Pastoral Charge (Richmond Hill)** and appoints **Ruth Noble**, ordained minister, beginning September 1, 2021 to February 28, 2022, part time based on 24 hours per week with the following terms for Category F and Cost of Living Group Assignment 5: Salary \$72,354 (pro-rated \$43,412.40) per annum, basic telephone \$800 per annum, Continuing Education and Learning Amount \$1474 (pro-rated \$884.40) per annum and all other terms according to The Manual I.2., and that in accordance with The Manual I.1.9 this re-appointment does not require an act of covenant.

... concurs with the request of **Knox, Agincourt Pastoral Charge (Toronto)** and appoints **Linda Petrides**, retired ordained minister, beginning July 1, 2021 to June 30, 2022, part time based on 10 hours per week with the following terms for Category F and Cost of Living Group Assignment 5: Salary \$72,354 (pro-rated \$18,088.50) salary in addition to the minimum at 11.72% which equals \$8479.89 (pro-rated \$2119.50) for a total salary of \$80,833.89 (pro-rated \$20,208) per annum, basic telephone \$840 per annum, Continuing Education and Learning Amount \$1474 (pro-rated \$369) per annum and all other terms according to The Manual I.2., and that in accordance with The Manual I.1.9 this re-appointment does not require an act of covenant.

... concurs with the request of **Tamil United Church Mission (Toronto)** and re-appoints **Kumar Thangarajah**, ordained minister, beginning July 1, 2021 to June 30, 2022, part time based on 30 hours per week with the following terms for Category F and Cost of Living Group Assignment 5: Salary \$72,354 (pro-rated \$54,265.50), per annum, basic telephone \$800 per annum, Continuing Education and Learning Amount \$1474 (pro-rated \$1105.50) per annum and all other terms according to The Manual I.2., and that in accordance with The Manual I.1.9 this re-appointment does not require an act of covenant.

... concurs with the request of **Kingsway-Lambton Pastoral Charge (Toronto)** and appoints **David Winsor**, retired ordained minister, beginning July 1, 2021 to December 31, 2021, part time based on 5 hours per week with the following terms for Category F and Cost of Living Group Assignment 5: Salary \$72,354 (pro-rated \$9044.25) per annum, basic telephone \$800 per annum, Continuing Education and Learning Amount \$1474 (pro-rated \$184.25) per annum and all other terms according to The Manual I.2., and that in accordance with The Manual I.1.9 this re-appointment does not require an act of covenant.

c) **License to Administer Sacraments**

... concurs with the request of **Trillium Pastoral Charge (Caledon)** and grants sacramental privileges in accordance with The Manual 1.2.4(a) and 1.2.4.2, to **Richard (William) Gardner**, candidate, during his time of appointment at Trillium Pastoral Charge.

d) **Voluntary Associate Minister Position**

... concurs with the request of **Jubilee Pastoral Charge (Toronto)** and **Bri-
anne Swan**, to enter a Voluntary Associate Minister relationship, beginning August 31, 2021.

e) **Request for Change in Relationship**

... in accordance with The Manual I.3.1.4(b) accepts the request for a change in pastoral relations of **Glen Eagle**, ordained minister at **Churchill Gilford Pastoral Charge (Churchill)** effective October 31, 2021 and gives thanks for his ministry.

... in accordance with The Manual I.3.1.4(b) accepts the request for a change in pastoral relations of **Cindy Cooper**, ordained minister at **Bayview Pastoral Charge (Toronto)** effective June 30, 2022 and gives thanks for her ministry.

... in accordance with The Manual I.3.1.4(b) accepts the request for a change in pastoral relations of **Ricardo Silva**, ordained minister at **Westway Pastoral Charge (Toronto)** effective October 29, 2021 and gives thanks for his ministry.

f) **Recommendations from the Licensed Lay Worship Leaders Committee meeting held June 14, 2021**

...concurs with the recommendation of the Licensed Lay Worship Leader Committee, and approves **Bonnie Neely** to be reconfirmed as a Licensed Lay Worship Leader within the bounds of Shining Waters Regional Council for a three-year period.

...concurs with the recommendation of the Licensed Lay Worship Leader Committee, and approves **Glen Greenwood** to be reconfirmed as a Licensed Lay Worship Leader within the bounds of Shining Waters Regional Council for a three-year period.

...concurs with the recommendation of the Licensed Lay Worship Leader Committee, and approves **Joanne Stenerson** to be reconfirmed as a Licensed Lay Worship Leader within the bounds of Shining Waters Regional Council for a three-year period.

MOTION

CARRIED

MOTION by Beth Moore / Donna Bowman-Woodall

that the Pastoral Relations Commission concurs with the request of **Dewi Sant Welsh Pastoral Charge (Toronto)** and re-appoints **M. Elizabeth Mackenzie**, ordained minister, beginning July 1, 2021 to June 30, 2022, full time based on 40 hours per week with the following terms for Category F and Cost of Living Group Assignment 5: Salary \$72,354 salary in addition to the minimum at 15% which equals \$10,853.10 for a total salary of \$83,207.10 per annum, basic telephone \$1020 per annum, Continuing Education and Learning Amount \$1474 per annum

August 31, 2021 - 6

and all other terms according to The Manual I.2., and that in accordance with The Manual I.1.9 this re-appointment does not require an act of covenant.

MOTION

CARRIED

(Elizabeth Mackenzie recused herself from this item)

Report from staff

a) Liaisons

The following liaisons have been appointed by staff:

Lynella Reid-James appointed as liaison to Ghana Calvary Methodist Pastoral Charge (Toronto) for profile and position description as pastoral charge moves from appointment to provisional call.

Julie Brushey appointed as liaison to Churchill Gilford Pastoral Charge (Innisfil) for profile and search.

Sadekie Lyttle-Forbes appointed as liaison to Bayview Pastoral Charge (Toronto) for profile and search.

Paul Stott appointed as liaison to Rosedale Pastoral Charge (Toronto) for search for their second minister.

b) Pastoral Charge Supervisors

The following pastoral charge supervisors have been appointed by staff:

Rev. Warren Ball appointed to Stouffville Pastoral Charge as of July 1, 2021

Rev. Amy Crawford appointed to Islington Pastoral Charge (Toronto) as of January 1, 2022.

Rev. Len Medeiros appointed to Cheltenham Pastoral Charge as of September 1, 2021

Rev. Jean Ward appointed to Westway Pastoral Charge (Toronto) as of August 20, 2021.

Equity Goal for 2020-21:

The Pastoral Relations Commission set the following goal for the year 2020-21: Collect data on the pastoral relations process from entry point to the end of the first year answering

this question: How does unconscious racist/sexist/ableist bias hinder or create barriers for ministers in the congregational setting? Who is chosen? Are there differences in the terms of the pastoral relationship between ministers who are White and all other racialized ministers and why? Also look at that question for the LGBTQi community. What is the experience of racialized, BIPOC, differently abled and LGBTQi ministers after one year on their pastoral relationship – How does unconscious racist/sexist/ableist bias affect their health, joy and excellence in ministry?

General Council 44 (GC44) Salary Equity Proposal

APPENDIX A

A task group consisting of Donna Bowman-Woodall, Liz Mackenzie, Paul Stott, and Robin Pilkey have prepared a draft of the GC44 proposal which was called for at the June 2021 PRC meeting.

There are no changes made to the proposal.

MOTION by Donna Bowman-Woodall / Robin Pilkey
that the Salary Equity Proposal be forwarded to Shining Waters Regional Council.

MOTION

CARRIED

Next Meeting

Commission members asked that the following be discussed at the September meeting when discussing the future direction for implementing the Equity Goal Research Report: a policy for Shining Waters Regional Council that mandates the same percentage above minimum salary for those in team ministry in one community of faith.

The next meeting of the Pastoral Relations Commission will be held by Zoom video conference on Tuesday, September 28, 2020 at 9:00 a.m.

End of meeting

There being no further business, Todd McDonald closed the meeting with a prayer at 9:35 a.m.

Paul Stott, acting Chair

Todd McDonald, note taker

APPENDIX A – GC44 Salary Equity Proposal (Draft)

[PROPOSAL NAME]

Origin: [Shining Waters Regional Council (Pastoral Relations Commission)]

1. What is the issue? (describe in broad terms)

We believe that as followers of Jesus the Christ we are called to a way of justice and equity. Recognizing the current state of inequity of salaries of ministry personnel, particularly between personnel in the same community of faith and personnel in the same geographical area, we believe God is calling us as a denomination to create more equitable compensation policies for ministry personnel. Specifically to:

- immediately put into place measures that will assure the same percentage above minimum salary for those in team ministry in one community of faith
- make it part of the work of a community of faith to disclose the amount paid to previous ministry personnel—particularly % above minimum &/or extra benefits—when calling/appointing new ministry personnel
- create an updated resource for ministry personnel re: negotiation process and resources/tools for negotiation, as well as a process whereby ministry personnel are oriented/educated regarding negotiation (this could involve liaisons, Pastoral Relations Ministers, and/or Pastoral Relations Commission, etc.)

2. Why is this issue important?

- the key underlying issue is pay/compensation disparity
- this includes disparity in compensation between large urban congregations and rural congregations; disparity between GCO salaries and pastoral charge salaries; compensation disparity in team ministry within one community of faith; salary inequity in pension resulting from salary inequity throughout careers; compensation disparity between newly called/appointed ministry personnel and (an) immediate predecessor(s)
- pay equity is a theological, ecclesiological and a justice issue
- the key underlying issues are issues of compensation equity for all ministry personnel; the need to create a theology of compensation, rather than a business model of compensation; the question of whether our denomination subscribes to a model of equal pay for equal work, or a model that lifts up qualifications and achievements
- historically the question of salary equity has been an issue since the formation of the United Church in 1925, and the three major founding denominations brought with them differing traditions.
- almost every General Council since has seen the issue arise in memorials or resolutions
- most recently in November of 2014, the General Council Executive approved a minimum comprehensive compensation model for ministry personnel not residing in a manse, to be implemented in July, 2015; since then the church and ministry

- personnel have been learning how to live into this model, and the weaknesses of this model are now being exposed
- the principles informing this issue include: fairness, equity, justice
 - the benefits of these actions support and contribute to the regional councils' mandate of joy, health, and excellence for ministry personnel
 - while we are reluctant to 'crystal-ball' the future without action on these issues, we respectfully suggest that if there were no action taken on this issue, there will be increased disparity in compensation packages in our church; the theology of compensation may be lost to the business model of the world; the need for increased equity in our pastoral relations system, as identified in the Final Report of the Equity Goal Research Project of the Shining Waters Pastoral Relations Commission, will not happen

3. How does this proposal help us to live into our church's commitments on equity?

- regarding welcoming people of all sexual orientations and gender identities into full membership and ministry in the church, this proposal offers some initial ways of assuring all ministry personnel are paid the same amount for the same work, regardless of sexual orientation and/or gender identity
- regarding committing to becoming an intercultural church, this proposal offers initial ways of insuring that all ministry personnel are treated fairly during all pastoral relations processes, including salary and benefit negotiation
- regarding opposing discrimination of any kind on the basis of identity, and developing an anti-racism policy and committing to becoming an anti-racist denomination, this proposal offers simple steps that can be taken towards assuring that all ministry personnel are treated fairly and impartially

Who has been consulted in the development of the proposal? Was the proposal developed "with" people, or "on behalf of" people? What might be the impact of this proposal on people and communities? Who is advantaged and who is disadvantaged by this approach?

- the Pastoral Relations Commission of Shining Waters Regional Council was consulted in the development of this proposal
- the Final Report of the Equity Goal Research Project, done for the Pastoral Relations Commission of Shining Waters Regional Council was consulted. This report was developed with interviews of ministry personnel, search committees and pastoral relations liaisons. This report is the result of the commitment of the Pastoral Relations Commission of Shining Waters Region to examine the regions's pastoral relations policies and procedures through an equity lens. The commission was particularly interested to know how racist/sexist/ableist bias has impacted ministry personnel and the pastoral relationships in our communities of faith in Shining Waters Regional Council. See Appendix and <https://shiningwatersregionalcouncil.ca/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/Equity-Goal-Research-Project-Final-Report.pdf>
- a paper entitled Paying the Pastor: A Critical Analysis of the Development of Salary Policy in the United Church of Canada, written by Paul Stott, was consulted

- ministry personnel working in team in a pastoral charge could benefit from this proposal
- while communities of faith will not be disadvantaged by this proposal, they could be ‘pushed’ to examine more closely their assets and their theology of compensation

4. How might the General Council respond to the issue?

The (regional council) proposes that the General Council could:

Name a possible response that the General Council might consider:

A. Study/discussion of the issue

- Study and develop a theology of compensation that would inform new compensation policies in the future

B. Action on the issue: General Council could

- immediately put into place measures that will assure the same percentage above minimum salary for those in team ministry in one community of faith
- make it part of the work of a community of faith to disclose the amount paid to previous ministry personnel—particularly % above minimum and/or extra benefits—when calling/appointing new ministry personnel;
- pastoral relations commissions be mandated by GC to include a process to inform and coach ministry personnel in negotiation of fair compensation
- create an updated and enhanced resource for ministry personnel re: negotiation process and resources/tools for negotiation, as well as a process whereby ministry personnel are oriented/educated regarding negotiation (this could involve liaisons, Pastoral Relations Ministers, and/or Pastoral Relations Commission, etc.)
- examine how compensation contributes to the UCC’s equity work and strategies
- examine the Shining Waters Equity Goal research as a contribution to the church’s work on this issue.

5. For the body transmitting this proposal to the General Council:

Are there comments, affirmations, suggestions you would like to make with respect to this proposal? Is this proposal in response to a previous proposal, motion or action? If so, please name the previous action(s) and proposal number(s).

If you have questions regarding this proposal, please send them to info@generalcouncil44.ca.

APPENDIX A

QUOTES FROM EQUITY RESEARCH PROJECT

Many of these direct biases also correlate with systemic biases. For example, there are unwritten norms differentiating the negotiation process for an appointment versus a call. Sometimes this means not haggling over a few months' worth of terms, or Communities of Faith taking the opportunity to save some money while they are in search mode.

- “I had an assumption that because contracts were short, there was no negotiation process. They never opened the door and I don't think I ever knocked.”
- “I am comfortable with the appointment, but if I was offered a call, I would negotiate the heck out of that.”

What becomes problematic about this, is when it is held up against the statistics of who (gender, age, race, etc) are offered appointments versus calls. (See final section for details).—p.28

Many participants would like a set of guidelines and best practices for negotiating terms, beyond what is available in the UCC Pastoral Relations: Search and Selection Handbook (2000), so that these skills are not concentrated among certain privileged demographics.—p. 30

Pro-active regional support and intervention in the initial pastoral relationship, are crucial to many equity-seeking ministry personnel. These include sharing historical information the Regional Council has about a Community of Faith, such as past schisms and landmines, and the previous ministers' terms of call/appointment, particularly % over minimum, technical allowances over basic phone for internet costs, etc. The Regional Council could also encourage discussions with past ministers to understand community dynamics.—p. 31